Safety & Health Management Systems: Comparing the Options

A Review of National & International SHMS Standards
Any safety and health management system (SHMS) specifies processes to continuously improve S&H performance while simultaneously complying with regulations, e.g., MSHA, OSHA, etc.

It provides the framework to integrate the SHMS with your overall business plan/mine plan, etc.

Adopting/adapting a SHMS for use in your company requires an investment in resources: time & people.

The aim should be a SHMS that is consistent with the your organization’s needs & management approach.
Questions to Ask in Selecting a SHMS

- Does your company have an existing SHMS?
- Does your company have experience developing SHMS’s?
- Does your company have both MSHA & OSHA obligations?
- Does your company have international operations?
- Does your company have business outside of mining?
- Does your company have good operating management systems?
NMA CORESafety SHMS

- Member companies to develop a SHMS that is equivalent to the example SHMS developed through CORESafety.

- Allows maximum flexibility for companies to choose an approach that works best for them.

- In the U.S., three SHMSs have gained attention and interest: OHSAS 18001, ANSI Z-10 and OSHA VPP.
Options for Selecting a SHMS

1. If you already have an SHMS, keep it and use CORESafety for areas of additional improvement.

2. Adopt NMA’s CORESafety generic SHMS.

3. Develop a customized system.

4. Adapt an existing national or international system:
   a. ANSI Z-10, 2007
   b. OHSAS 18001, 2007
   c. OSHA VPP
OHSAS 18001

**Scope**

- Internationally recognized model for Occupational Health and Safety Assessment Series (OHSAS) for management systems.

**Purpose**

- Enable organizations to control their S&H risks and improve their S&H performance.

**Application**

- Specification is intended to address occupational health and safety, rather than product and services safety.
- A S&H management *assessment series* for SHMSs. Intended to help an organizations control S&H risks.
Why and Where Was OHSAS 18001 Developed?

- In response to urgent demand for a recognizable occupational health and safety management system standard.

- Need for health and safety management system that could be audited and certified.

- 13 cooperating organizations from around the world assisted in development of OHSAS 18001: Spain, Malaysia, UK and several other European standards organizations.
Major Elements of OHSAS 18001

- Planning for hazard identification, risk assessment & risk control
- OHSAS management program
- Structure & responsibility
- Training, awareness & competence
- Consultation & communication
- Operational control
- Emergency preparedness & response
- Performance measuring, monitoring & improvement
American National Standards Institute (ANSI) Z-10

Scope

- Defines minimum requirements for a SHMS.

Purpose

- Management tool to reduce risks of injury, illnesses, etc.

Application

- Organizations of all sizes & types of businesses. Specific to the U.S. Non-specific to any one industry.
Major Elements of ANSI Z-10

- Management leadership & employee participation
- Planning
- Implementation of the SHMS
- Evaluation & corrective action
- Management review
ANSI Z-10 Elements

3.0 Mgmt Leadership
- Management Leadership
  - OH&S Management System
  - Policy Statement
  - Responsibility and Authority
- Employee Participation

4.0 Planning
- Review
  - Gap analysis
  - Regulations, standards, etc.
  - Resources
  - Hazard analysis
  - Exposures
- Assessment & Prioritization
  - Risk Determination
  - Trend analysis
- Objectives
- Plans and Resources

5.0 Implementation & Operation
- Operational Elements
  - Hierarchy of Controls
  - Design Review and MOC
  - Procurement
  - Contractors
  - Emergency Preparedness
- Education, Training, Awareness & Competence
- Communication
- Documentation & Record Control

6.0 Checking & Corrective Action
- Measurement, Monitoring & Assessment
- Incident Investigation
- Audits
  - OHSAS
  - Compliance
- Corrective & Preventive Actions
- Planning
- Feedback

7.0 Management Review
- Risk Reduction Outcomes & Follow-ups
Benefits of the ANSI Z-10

- It can reduce workplace risks, injuries & improve bottom line.
- As a voluntary consensus standard, it is compatible with quality & environmental management system standards.
- It aligns with other U.S. & international guidelines for OHSMS.
- Its approach aims for long-term solution to eliminate causes of deficiencies.
- It can help reduce hazards, risks, improve productivity & financial results.
OSHA’s Voluntary Protection Program (VPP)

- OSHA’s VPP recognizes that enforcement of OSHA standards alone cannot fully achieve the objectives of the OSHA Act of 1970.

- Good SHMSs go beyond the OSHA standards.

- A quality safety program must be approached as a business priority, just as productivity, quality and customer satisfaction are.

- A safety culture can protect workers more effectively than stand alone, one dimensional OSHA compliance. The OSHA standards primarily address the physical worksite. Safety must be both regulatory and people-centered.

- VPP worksites have a performance-based approach to safety that includes the VPP criteria and elements as a foundation.
OSHA’s Voluntary Protection Program (VPP)

- A basic and voluntary management system sponsored by OSHA.
- With VPP, OSHA-regulated site agrees to have OSHA heavily audit the site. Approval of VPP status leads to modified enforcement status.
- In the VPP, management, labor and OSHA establish cooperative relationships at workplaces that have implemented a comprehensive safety & health management system.
- Approval into VPP is OSHA’s official recognition of the outstanding efforts of employers and employees who have achieved exemplary occupational safety & health.
Major Elements of OSHA VPP

- Management leadership
- Employee involvement
- Worksite analysis
- Hazard prevention
- Safety & health training
Comparing Management Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas of Comparison</th>
<th>CORESafety</th>
<th>OHSAS 18001</th>
<th>ANSI Z10</th>
<th>OSHA VPP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Defined goals &amp; objectives (e.g., 0:50:5)</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior management pledge</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior management acceptance of responsibility for S&amp;H</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appoint a senior manager to develop the SHMS</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership development process</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility &amp; accountability</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Risk management</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Partial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency planning &amp; response</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training &amp; competence</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Training only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture enhancement</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration &amp; communication</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Comparing Management Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas of Comparison</th>
<th>CORESafety</th>
<th>OHSAS 18001</th>
<th>ANSI Z10</th>
<th>OSHA VPP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reinforcement &amp; recognition</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Planned Intervals</td>
<td>Intervals</td>
<td>Min Annually</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change management</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resources &amp; planning</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work procedures &amp; permits</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational health</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incident investigation</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Investigation of near miss incidents</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Discretionary</td>
<td>Discretionary</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior optimization</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering &amp; construction</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contractor management &amp; purchasing</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assurance (regulatory compliance)</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Comparing Management Systems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas of Comparison</th>
<th>CORESafety</th>
<th>OHSAS 18001</th>
<th>ANSI Z10</th>
<th>OSHA VPP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S&amp;H management assurance</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizational change management</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee reward/incentive system</td>
<td>Discretionary</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHMS self-assessment</td>
<td>Initial</td>
<td>Intervals</td>
<td>Annual</td>
<td>Annual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External sharing of lessons learned</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent internal site audits</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>System assessment by third party.</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&amp;H management metrics &amp; trends analysis</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent internal site audits</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External reporting, e.g., NMA, MSHA.</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation &amp; information management</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Included</td>
<td>Not Included</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>